
ESADEgeo Case Study Part A



Kicking the can down the road

The political economy of Europe's sovereign debt crisis, 2010-2011

Adrian Garcia

ESADE Full-time MBA 2012

Angel Saz-Carranza

Director, ESADEgeo Center for Global Economy and Geopolitics

This case study was originally published as a position paper by ESADEgeo in September 2012. It has been altered for the purposes of the [MEKBiz](#) project co-funded by the European Commission.

Kicking the can down the road: The political economy of Europe's sovereign debt crisis, 2010-2011

Adrian Garcia Angel Saz-Carranza

Full-time MBA 2012 Director, ESADEgeo Center for Global
ESADE Economy and Geopolitics

Introduction

This paper will focus on the European Sovereign Debt Crisis from the perspectives of four critical actors (the European Commission, European Central Bank, France, and Germany), starting at the beginning stages of the crisis through to the Fiscal Pact of December 2011. We will look at the actors' respective positions at critical points of the crisis through excerpts from news articles, describing the outcomes that sprang from addressing the crisis as it developed. Through this study, this paper will also show how the various mechanisms to combat the crisis (the European Financial Stabilization Mechanism, European Financial Stability Facility, and European Stability Mechanism) have represented points of contention between the different Euro zone countries.

In looking to protect their interests, the actors have solidified or changed their stances at different points during the crisis. This paper will commence with a short look at the respective interests and power base of each of the four actors. Thereafter, four crisis points will be examined in turn: the first Greek bailout (May 2010), the imminent Portuguese and Irish bailouts (May 2011), the necessity for a second Greek bailout along with the unsustainable Italian bond yield rates (October 2011) and the Greek Referendum (December 2011).

The actors: positions, interests and power bases

The main actors have derived their positions at each stage from protecting their own interests and reinforcing them with their power base.

Technical legitimacy is the power base of the **European Commission (COM)**. The principle it defends is that of Europeanism, on one hand, and, on the other, the supremacy of politics over economic and monetary purism. That is: that in the face of the troubles encountered by Greece, a political intervention is necessary - despite the fact that the Greek difficulties are consequences of economic mismanagement.

The **European Central Bank (ECB)** is the legitimate institution that determines the monetary policy of the EU. The ECB's primary aim is to maintain financial stability in the EU. It is politically independent and its area of work spans the interdependence of monetary and economic policy.

France's power base is its capacity as a lender or guarantor of European financial aid to Greece, as well as its large voting power in the Council. The basic principle it supports is similar to COM: the supremacy of politics over economic and monetary purism. Its interests are the well-being of France - threatened by the instability caused by the euro crisis - and the reelection of its President.

Germany, the economic engine of the EU and cornerstone of euro, has strong voting power and would be the main contributor to a possible rescue fund. Its interests are ultimately German well-being, and the reelection of its Chancellor. The principles it defends are the political independence of the ECB, economic and monetary discipline, and the consequentiality of one's actions.

Prologue

In late 2009, a new socialist Greek government, elected in October of that year, massively revises the Greek budget deficit for 2009 – accusing the previous Government of trying to cover up the extent of its deficit. The revision increases the deficit forecast from 6-8% (estimated by the previous government) to 12.7%. The Greek sovereign debt crisis is unleashed.

1) Context – February-April 2010 – Greece

After instituting austerity measures, Greek Prime Minister George Papandreou insists that Greece does not need a bailout. Greek bond yields skyrocket as the deficit is revised to 13.6% of GDP from the previously thought 12.7%. In April, after the financial markets take a turn for the worse, Euro zone countries discuss providing Greece with 30 billion euros in emergency loans.

The **European Commission** calls [REDACTED]

“European Union officials are exploring the possibility of providing a heavily-conditioned loan to Greece instead of seeing it turn to the International Monetary Fund.

Speaking after a meeting in Paris on 14 January with France's President Nicolas Sarkozy, Jean Claude Juncker, president of the Euro group said: “We do not think that assistance from the IMF to Greece would be appropriate or welcome.”

✚ European Voice – “EU Explores loan to Greece” – January 21, 2010

France wants [REDACTED]

“When French President Nicolas Sarkozy put forward Strauss-Kahn's name to run the IMF, he meant to park a past and potentially future rival in a faraway place about which people cared little. Then the global financial crisis hit, and Strauss-Kahn was propelled to centre-stage.

With France's next presidential election fast approaching in 2012, the last thing Sarkozy now needs is for Strauss-Kahn to play a statesman-like role in saving the eurozone.”

✚ European Voice – “Will Greece go to the IMF” – February 22, 2010

The **ECB** wants [REDACTED]

“Common and co-ordinated progress to create a European public bond market, after the remarkable performance of the European Central Bank in September-October 2008, would signal a strong Europe that has innovative financial instruments beyond the common currency. At the height of the financial crisis in September 2008, Jean-Claude Trichet, the president of the European Central Bank (ECB), exclaimed that there were limits to what the ECB could achieve for lack of conventional budget and debt instruments. A Europe where the weaker members of the Euro zone run first to powerful outside creditors for help only demonstrates the ECB's weakness.”

✦ European Voice – “Has the EU escaped a Chinese rescue?” – February 17, 2010

Germany wants [REDACTED]

“Germany wants discretion about any financial aid for Greece.

Germany is resisting any announcement of a financial assistance package for Greece at the EU summit meeting in Brussels on 25-26 March. France and Belgium are leading the calls for EU leaders to shore up confidence in the Euro zone by some promise of support.

Germany is backed by the Dutch and Austrian governments in arguing for discretion. Only if the Greek government fails to refinance its debt and is obliged to seek assistance from Euro zone members should any announcement be made, they say.”

✦ European Voice – “Division over Greek support at EU summit” – March 18, 2010

“Germany is struggling to quell accusations that it has made the crisis worse by delaying triggering the package until after a regional election in North Rhine-Westphalia, Germany's largest federal state, on 9 May.”

✦ European Voice – “EU leaders struggle to contain eurozone crisis” – April 29, 2010

Results:

[To be shared post-discussion]

2) Context - May 2011 – Portugal and Ireland get bailout

The Irish government, reeling from a banking crisis that is much more severe than initially thought, successfully applies on November 29, 2010 for a €67.5 billion bailout from the EU and IMF. Meanwhile, Greece and Portugal's debt ratings are placed on downgrade watch by Standard and Poor's, bringing more uncertainty to the region.

The **European Commission** and **ECB** call [REDACTED]

"Mr Schaeuble said he wants the Euro zone to do more than just bolster its crisis response fund, in order to "absolve us from the necessity to react again every couple of months". Both the European Commission and the European Central Bank (ECB) have called for an increase in the size of the EFSF, as well as giving it new powers, such as the right to buy up Euro zone government debt."

+ BBC News - "Euro up despite no sign of rescue fund deal" – January 18, 2011

France calls [REDACTED]

"Germany and France want talks on changes to the EFSF to be linked to boosting Euro zone competitiveness through higher retirement ages, national laws to cap debt, a common corporate tax base and an end to wage indexing to inflation."

+ Reuters – "EU Finance ministers to discuss rescue fund" – February 13, 2011

Germany wants [REDACTED]

"What we want to establish is a pact for competitiveness, and in so doing we want to make it very clear that we intend to grow together more closely on a political level," Mrs Merkel said [...]"

+ BBC News – "France and Germany propose EU 'Competitiveness pact'" – February 4, 2011

"The sources said that while there was agreement that the EFSF effective lending capacity should be boosted to the full 440 billion euros, there was no consensus yet on how to do that. One of the ideas, favored by Germany, is that countries with a triple A credit rating would increase their guarantees for the fund, while those below triple A would inject cash."

+ Reuters - "EU Finance ministers to discuss rescue fund" – February 13, 2011

Results:

[To be shared post-discussion]

3) Context - October 2011 – Italian Bond Yields Rise and Greece Debt

The concern of contagion in Europe spreads, as the ECB buys Italian and Spanish bonds in attempt to lower their borrowing costs and as it becomes clear that Greece will miss its next budget deficit targets. Italy passes a €50 billion-austerity budget but cannot avoid Standard and Poor's downgrading its public debt along with Spain's. Euro zone ministers debate whether to release the next tranche of loans to Greece and/or to write off a portion of its debt and whether there is an urgent necessity to recapitalize the region's banks.

France is

“France wants to have the European Central Bank at the centre of any effort to increase the firepower of the bailout facility, the EFSF. Germany does not. Germany wants bondholders to face much steeper "haircuts" on Greek debt. France does not - in part because of what it might mean for some politically important French banks.”

+ BBC News – “Waiting game for euro crisis” – October 21, 2011

The ECB is

“France and the European Central Bank do not want to restructure Greek debt further, fearing market contagion and, for Paris, additional pressure on French banks that hold significant amounts of Greek, Spanish and Italian debt.”

+ The New York Times – “Europeans Seek Bold Debt Deal, Despite Differences” – October 21, 2011

“European Central Bank President Jean-Claude Trichet started buying Italian and Spanish assets today in his riskiest attempt yet to tame the sovereign debt crisis. Italian and Spanish bonds surged as the ECB entered the market, sending yields down the most since the euro began in 1999.”

+ Bloomberg – “Trichet Draws ECB 'Bazooka' In Bond Purchases” – August 8, 2011

Germany wants

“On Greece, Germany appears willing for a deal to restructure Greek debt to no more than half of its face value, to try to bring Greece's debt burden to a sustainable level. But Germany wants private investors and banks to accept such losses voluntarily to avoid a formal default, which would be a first for the Euro zone. [...] France and Germany also disagree on how to leverage or maximize the \$590 billion bailout fund to create a “wall of money” to discourage the markets from speculating further on Spain and Italy. The fund has already committed about \$200 billion to Greece, Portugal and

Ireland, and the German government has promised taxpayers that its own share, as the largest contributor, will not be more than \$305 billion.”

⊕ The New York Times – “Europeans Seek Bold Debt Deal, Despite Differences” – October 21, 2011

“France wants to have the European Central Bank at the centre of any effort to increase the firepower of the bailout facility, the EFSF. Germany does not.”

⊕ BBC News – “Waiting game for euro crisis” – October 21, 2011

Results:

[To be shared post-discussion]

4) Context – December 2011 – Greek Referendum Announced after Greek bailout agreement

Europe is thrown into further turmoil in early November, when Greek Prime Minister George Papandreou calls a surprise referendum on the recent bailout plan agreed upon in Brussels and eventually resigns amidst international pressure. The threat of contagion becomes much more real when Italian 10-year bond rates hit record and unsustainable highs above 7%. This leads Italian Prime Minister Silvio Berlusconi to resign, making way for a technocratic government led by Mario Monti, which is designed to alleviate some of the market and international pressure. Angela Merkel and Nicolas Sarkozy call for EU treaty changes in governing relations, but differ in the degree of involvement of the EU in national budgets.

European Commission pushes [REDACTED]

“The second proposal that has gained some traction is to issue Eurobonds (for the debts of one to become the debts of all). The EU Commission was pushing that solution yesterday.”

⊕ BBC News - “Merkel and Sarkozy agree to disagree” - November 24, 2011

France is [REDACTED]

“However, Mr Sarkozy rejected suggestions that national budgets could be approved and regulated in Brussels, and said France would not give up its sovereignty.”

⊕ BBC News – “Merkel urges euro fiscal union to tackle debt crisis” – December 2, 2011

The ECB [REDACTED]

“You won’t solve the crisis by reducing incentives for the Italian government to act,” Weidmann, who also leads Germany’s Bundesbank, told the Financial Times in an interview published yesterday. He also said that the ECB’s benchmark interest rate is “appropriate” at 1.25 percent after last month’s surprise quarter-point cut.”

⊕ Bloomberg Businessweek – “ECB Officials Dismiss Calls for Backstop Role to Fight Turmoil” –November 15, 2011

Germany is [REDACTED]

“A joint liability for others’ debts is not acceptable,” she said. “Eurobonds are not a rescue measure in this crisis.” [...] “We need budget discipline and an effective crisis management mechanism,” she said. “So we need to change the treaties or create new treaties.” [...] Mrs Merkel promised “concrete steps towards a fiscal union” - in effect close integration of the tax-and-spend policies of individual Euro zone countries”.

⊕ BBC News – “Merkel urges euro fiscal union to tackle debt crisis” –December 2, 2011

Results:

[To be shared post-discussion]

Epilogue

[To be shared post-discussion]

Bibliography

- Brockett, Matthew, and Jeff Black. "Trichet Draws 'Bazooka' as Italy, Spain Debt Purchases Begin." *Bloomberg*, August 8, 2011. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2011-08-07/trichet-draws-ecb-bazooka-to-stem-contagion>.
- Brunsdon, Jim. "EU Leaders Struggle to Contain Eurozone Crisis." *European Voice*, April 28, 2010. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.politico.eu/article/eu-leaders-struggle-to-contain-eurozone-crisis/>.
- "ECB Officials Dismiss Calls for Backstop Role to Fight Turmoil." *Bloomberg Businessweek*, November 15, 2011.
- Erlanger, Steven. "Europeans Seek Bold Debt Deal, Despite Differences." *The New York Times*, October 21, 2011. Accessed October 29, 2015. http://www.nytimes.com/2011/10/22/world/europe/hopes-high-for-a-europe-debt-deal-despite-french-and-german-disagreements.html?_r=0.
- "Euro Up Despite No Sign of Rescue Fund Deal." *BBC News*, January 18, 2011. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.bbc.com/news/business-12214176>.
- Flanders, Stephanie. "Waiting Game for Euro Crisis." *BBC News*, October 21, 2011. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.bbc.com/news/business-15408256>.
- Fleming, Stewart. "EU Explores Loan to Greece." *European Voice*, January 20, 2010. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.politico.eu/article/eu-explores-loan-to-greece/>.
- "France and Germany Propose EU 'Competitiveness Pact.'" *BBC News*, February 4, 2011. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-12368401>.
- Godement, François. "Has the EU Escaped a Chinese Rescue?" *European Voice*, February 17, 2010. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.politico.eu/article/has-the-eu-escaped-a-chinese-rescue/>.
- Hewitt, Gavin. "Merkel and Sarkozy Agree to Disagree." *BBC News*, November 24, 2011. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-15875968>.
- Johnson, Simon. "Will Greece go to the IMF?" *European Voice*, February 22, 2010. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.politico.eu/article/will-greece-go-to-the-imf/>.
- "Merkel Urges Euro Fiscal Union to Tackle Debt Crisis." *BBC News*, December 2, 2011. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-15997784>.
- Strupczewski, Jan. "EU Finance Ministers to Discuss Rescue Fund." *Reuters*, February 13, 2011. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.reuters.com/article/2011/02/14/eu-finmins-idUSLDE71C0BT20110214>.
- Taylor, Simon. "Division over Greek Support at EU Summit." *European Voice*, March 17, 2010. Accessed October 29, 2015. <http://www.politico.eu/article/division-over-greek-support-at-eu-summit/>.

ESADE

Ramon Llull University